
MINUTES

Meeting: **Planning Committee**

Date: Friday 10 May 2024 at 10.00 am

Venue: Aldern House, Baslow Road, Bakewell

Chair: Cllr P Brady

Present: Cllr V Priestley, Ms R Bennett, Cllr M Beer, Cllr M Buckler, Cllr M Chaplin, Cllr B Hanley, Cllr A Hart, Cllr L Hartshorne, Cllr Mrs K Potter, Cllr K Richardson and Mr K Smith

Apologies for absence: Cllr I Huddleston, Cllr D Murphy and Cllr J Wharmby.

51/24 MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING OF 19 APRIL 2024

The minutes of the last meeting of the Planning Committee held on the 19th April 2024 were approved as a correct record, subject to the following amendment:

Minute 42/24

The wording to be amended to read "FULL APPLICATION- REPAIR AND CONVERSION OF BARNS"

52/24 URGENT BUSINESS

There was no urgent business.

53/24 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

16 members of the public were present to make representations to the Committee.

54/24 MEMBERS DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Item 7

Several Members over time have received representations from one of the speakers but have not committed to any views regarding this application.

Item 9

Cllr Brady serves on Taddington Parish Council however when this item came for discussion at the Parish Council meeting Cllr Brady did not vote.

Item 11

A number of Members knew the Agent as a previous employee of the Peak District National Park Authority.

Item 12

A number of Members had received an email from the Applicant however no Member had responded to the Applicant.

Item 13

Cllr Hanley has prior knowledge of this item but stated he has no prejudicial interest.

Item 14

A number of Members knew the Agent as a previous employee of the Peak District National Park Authority.

10.05am Cllr Buckler attended the meeting

55/24 FULL APPLICATION - REGULARISATION OF THE OVER TIPPED AREA TO THE EAST OF THE 1884/9/4 CONSENT, RETAINING USE OF THE SITE FOR DEPOSITING INDUSTRIAL WASTE FROM DSF REFRACTORIES AND CONSOLIDATION OF PROGRESSIVE RESTORATION AND AFTERCARE STRATEGY FOR THE REVISED SITE AREA AT FRIDEN LANDFILL SITE, NEWHAVEN, NR BUXTON SK17 0DX (NP/DDD/1022/1276, HM)

Some Members had visited the site the previous day.

The Planning Officer presented the report and outlined the reasons for approval as set out in the report.

Members noted that this application was submitted prior to the BNG mandatory requirement and therefore the 30 year statutory requirement rule cannot be applied. It will take some time to progressively restore the site, and therefore it was felt there would be greater biodiversity gain achieved beyond the statutory 5 year aftercare period and the proposal would ensure a greater enhancement to the site than if it was restored in accordance with existing requirements. Condition 13 imposes a Restoration Masterplan.

There was a question regarding the depth of the man-made lagoon and if life-preservers could be put in place around the lagoon. It was agreed a condition would be appended to any approval in order to accommodate this.

The motion to approve the application with an additional condition regarding life-preservers, was proposed, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to conditions covering the following matters and the additional condition to be included by the Planning Officer:

- 1. Duration of the use of the land for the deposit of waste arising from the nearby refractory works to cease on or before 31 December 2033.**
- 2. Scope of the permission listing the approved plans and documents for the avoidance of doubt.**
- 3. No waste other than inert waste arising from the nearby refractory works shall be imported to and deposited at the site.**
- 4. No heavy goods vehicles (HGVs) shall travel to or from the site other than via the existing gated site entrance off the A5012 as shown on the Location Plan Drawing No. ECL.8765.D01.007 Rev A.**
- 5. Appropriate vehicle sheeting to prevent material spillage, wind blow and dust nuisance.**
- 6. No operational vehicles shall enter the public highway unless their wheels and chassis have been cleaned to prevent material being deposited on the public highway.**
- 7. The working, restoration and aftercare of the site shall be carried out only in accordance the approved plans.**
- 8. Hours of working restricted to between 07:30 and 17:00 Mondays to Fridays.**
- 9. Measures shall be taken to minimise dust arising from the handling of inert waste in accordance with the Nuisance Health Risk Assessment dated May 2023.**
- 10. All vehicles, plant and machinery operated within the site shall be maintained in accordance with the manufacturer's specification at all times, and shall be fitted with and use effective silencers.**
- 11. The existing trees within the site/identified on the Proposed Restoration Masterplan Drawing No. ECL.8765.D01.002 Rev D shall be retained.**
- 12. Annual survey as described in paragraph 6.5.2 of the Closure and Aftercare Management Plan Rev B dated November 2023 shall be submitted for approval to the WPA. Annual survey information shall include details of how Biodiversity Net Gain is being met.**
- 13. The Proposed Restoration Masterplan Drawing No. ECL.8765.D01.002 Rev D and Closure and Aftercare Management Plan Rev B dated November 2023 shall be implemented in full accordance with the approved details. Restoration of the whole site shall be completed by 31 December 2034.**

14. Upon satisfactory completion of the restoration scheme, to be confirmed in writing by the WPA, the site shall thereafter be subject to a 5 year programme of aftercare requirements as detailed in the Closure and Aftercare Management Plan Rev B.

15. Condition to ensure the provision of buoyancy aids on site prior to the on-site surface water attenuation features holding water.

56/24 FULL APPLICATION - PROPOSED HOLIDAY RETREAT WITH HOLIDAY ACCOMMODATION INCLUDING 2 STATIC CARAVANS, 1 YURT, 9 TOURING CARAVAN PITCHES, 17 CAMPING PODS, 5 CAMPING PITCHES AND ANCILLARY FACILITIES INCLUDING TOILET BLOCK, CONVERSION OF POLE BARN TO FLEXIBLE SPACE FOR EVENTS, CONVERSION OF DUTCH BARN TO CATERING AREA, CONVERSION OF OLD MILKING PARLOUR TO 4 HOLIDAY LETS, REPLACEMENT OF 2 STOREY STORAGE BARN WITH 2 UNDERGROUND SINGLE STOREY HOLIDAY LET STUDIOS, A POLYTUNNEL AND ASSOCIATED ACCESS AND ACCESS TRACKS, PARKING AND LANDSCAPING AT HOME FARM, SHELDON (NP/DDD/1223/1459, AM)

The Planning Officer presented the report and outlined the reasons for refusal.

Some Members had visited the site the previous day.

It was noted that the footpath mentioned on the site visit is not actually on the site and starts at Lower Farm. The Conservation Area was clarified.

The following spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme:

Mr Andrew Ford – Sheldon Village Planning Committee

Mr Joe Noble – Sheldon Village Planning Committee

Mr Ammir Kohanzad – Applicant – Statement read out by a member of Democratic Services.

The Members noted from the site visit that this development can be seen from a distance and from a number of view points. It was noted that there is a lack of information provided in this application including:

- No ecological survey
- No tree survey
- No noise survey or noise management plan
- No list of sustainability measures to be employed so contrary to CC1 policy
- No drainage or suds proposals

The impact and upset imposed on the community was acknowledged by the Members.

It was discussed as to what would be acceptable and noted that small scale tourism development would be more likely to be acceptable. However this would be a different development than the current proposal. The Officer invited the applicant to use the Authority's pre-application advice service.

The Officer recommendation to refuse the application was moved, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be REFUSED for the following reasons:

- 1. The development would not be in the public interest and exceptional circumstances do not exist to justify the proposed major development. The proposal is therefore contrary to policies Core Strategy policies GSP1, GSP3 and DS1, Development Management policy DMC1 and the National Planning Policy Framework.**
- 2. The development would involve the retention of new build holiday accommodation and the conversion and alteration of modern buildings of no historic or vernacular merit contrary to Core Strategy policy RT2 and Development Management policy DMC10.**
- 3. The development would involve the retention and use of static caravans and is not an appropriate site for camping pods or the scale of touring caravans or camping proposed contrary to Core Strategy policy RT3 and Development Management policy DMR1.**
- 4. The development would result in a significant adverse visual and landscape impact and would significantly harm valued landscape character contrary to Core Strategy policy L1, Development Management policy DMC1 and DMC3 and the National Planning Policy Framework.**
- 5. Insufficient information has been submitted with the application to demonstrate that the application would enhance biodiversity or that the development would not harm trees, protected species or their habitat contrary to Core Strategy policy L2, Development Management policies DMC11, DMC12 and DMC13 and the National Planning Policy Framework.**
- 6. The development would result in harm to the Sheldon Conservation Area and its setting and the setting of the Grade II listed Church of St Michael and All Saints contrary to Core Strategy policy L3 and Development Management policies DMC5, DMC7 and DMC8. The harm identified would not be outweighed by public benefits arising from the development contrary to the National Planning Policy Framework.**
- 7. The development would result in harm to the character, appearance and amenity of the local area and neighbouring properties contrary to Core Strategy policy GSP3 and Development Management policy DMC3.**
- 8. Insufficient information has been submitted with the application to demonstrate that the development would encourage behavioural change to achieve a reduction in the need to travel or reduce traffic movements. Visitors to the development would be largely or wholly reliant upon the private car and therefore would not be a sustainable form of recreation development contrary to Core Strategy policies GSP3 and T2.**
- 9. Insufficient information has been submitted with the application to demonstrate that the development would be served by a suitable sustainable urban drainage scheme or that pollution from foul drainage associated with the development can be satisfactorily mitigated contrary to Core Strategy policy CC5, Development Management policy DMC14 and the**

National Planning Policy Framework.

10. The proposal would not deliver high quality design or the highest possible standards of carbon reductions and water efficiency in order to mitigate the causes of climate change contrary to Core Strategy policies GSP3 and CC1, Development Management policy DMC3, the Authority's adopted Supplementary Planning Documents 'Design Guide' and 'Climate Change and Sustainable Building' and the National Planning Policy Framework.

57/24 FULL APPLICATION - CONVERSION OF BARN TO HOLIDAY ACCOMMODATION AT THE OLD BARN, SMITHY LANE, PARWICH (NP/DDD/0124/0037, RD)

Some Members had visited the site the previous day.

The Planning Officer presented the report and outlined the reasons for approval as set out in the report.

It was noted that since the report was written an extra condition had been added relating to archaeological recording of the site.

The following spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme:

Mr Joe Oldfield – Agent

Members who had visited the site suggested that frosted glazing on the east end of the building would protect the neighbours privacy and it was agreed to add this in as a condition. Members felt some clarification over the field drainage was required and asked for a condition to be added regarding drainage as it was not clear how rain-water goods would function.

Overall Members felt this was a sympathetic restoration of the original building. The existence of the village map on the side of the building was noted.

A motion to approve the application was proposed and seconded, put to the vote and carried subject to additional conditions regarding the windows and drainage and archaeological recording.

RESOLVED:

That the application is APPROVED subject to the following conditions and the additional conditions outlined by the Planning Officer:

- 1. Statutory time limit**
- 2. In accordance with amended plans**
- 3. Conversion in shell only**
- 4. Agree landscaping scheme**
- 5. Agree external lighting**
- 6. Agree biodiversity enhancement measures**

7. Design details
8. Underground service lines
9. Removal of permitted development rights
10. Climate change mitigation measures
11. Drainage details to be agreed
12. Archaeological recording to be secured
13. Obscuring or obstructing of window to eastern end of principal elevation to be secured.

The meeting adjourned for a short break at 11.20am and returned at 11.35am.

58/24 FULL APPLICATION - CONVERSION OF STONE FIELD BARN TO CREATE A THREE-BEDROOM PROPERTY WITH INTEGRATED ONE-BEDROOM ACCOMMODATION FOR USE AS ANNEXE OR HOLIDAY ACCOMMODATION AT BARN OFF BROADWAY LANE, NR PRIESTLIFFE, TADDINGTON (NP/DDD/0223/0117,MN)

The Planning Officer presented the report and outlined the reasons for refusal.

Members were reminded that this was an application that was deferred at the December 2023 meeting in order for officers to resolve matters of conserving the interior heritage character, the extent of the curtilage, and matters of climate change mitigation, and to approve the application under delegation if this was achieved. Having been unable to come to agreement with the applicant on these matters, the application was returning to committee for determination by Members. Some amendments have been received since the report was drafted which were explained by the Officer in his presentation.

The following spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme:

- Miss Ellie Hensby, Applicant

It was noted that other proposals for alternative internal layout had not been put forward to address the concerns raised in these regards. The Members felt that there is no sound rationale as to why the floor space could not be reversed. Members were also concerned about the exposure and isolation of the building and its' relationship to the landscape. There were concerns regarding the extent and enclosure of curtilage, and of how parking would be accommodated.

A motion to refuse the application in line with Officer recommendation was proposed, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be REFUSED for the following reasons:

- 1. The proposed conversion would harm the heritage significance of the barn by virtue of domestication of its character and setting, with no material planning considerations outweighing that harm, contrary to policies L3, DMC3, DMC5, and DMC10, and to the heritage provisions of the NPPF.**
- 2. The proposed conversion would harm the special landscape character of the locality by virtue of domestication of the barn and its rural agricultural setting, with no material planning considerations outweighing that harm, contrary to policies L1, DMC3, and DMC10, and to the provisions of the NPPF insofar as they relate to landscape protection within National Parks.**

59/24 FULL APPLICATION - PROPOSED EXTENSION TO DWELLING AT THE ORCHARDS, MONSDALE LANE, PARWICH (NP/DDD/0921/0990, SC)

Some Members had visited the site the previous day.

The Planning Officer presented the report and outlined the reasons for refusal.

This application was previously deferred by Members in June 2022 to allow for the Applicant and Officers to work together to find an improved design solution. It was noted that this new application was the same scale and form as the previous applications and would have a significant visual impact on the host dwelling.

The following spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme:

- Rosie Ward – Applicant
- Lynette Coyne – Agent

Members weighed up the pros and cons of developing the current building versus a new build for affordable housing in a small village.

A motion to approve the application contrary to Officer recommendation was moved, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application is APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

- 1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun within 3 years from the date of this permission.**
- 2. The development hereby permitted shall not be carried out other than in accordance with the following amended 1:100 elevation plan and 1:100 floor plan received by the Authority on the 31 January 2024 and subject to the following conditions.**

3. All new stonework shall be natural limestone with natural gritstone surrounds in accordance with samples which shall have first been submitted to and approved in writing by the National Park Authority.
4. Prior to the erection of the external walls a sample panel (a minimum of 1 square metre) of the natural limestone walls, natural gritstone surrounds and pointing shall be erected on site for inspection and approval in writing by the National Park Authority. The development shall not be carried out other than in accordance with an approved sample panel.
5. The roof shall be clad with clay tiles to match the existing.
6. Prior to the installation of any new windows and doors construction details (including detailed window and door design, recess from external walls, materials and external finish) shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the National Park Authority. The development shall thereafter not be carried out other than in accordance with the approved details.
7. The rainwater goods shall be metal, fitted on rise and fall brackets fixed to the stonework and painted black at the time of installation.
8. The roof verges shall be flush pointed with no fascia boards or projecting timberwork.

60/24 FULL APPLICATION - CHANGE OF USE OF BARN TO HOLIDAY LET, AND ERECTION OF SINGLE STOREY LEAN-TO EXTENSION ON NORTHERN GABLE AT BARN TO THE SOUTH OF HOLE CARR FARM, LONGNOR (NP/SM1123/1403, PM)

Some Members had visited the site the previous day.

The Planning Officer presented the report and outlined the reasons for refusal.

The following spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme.

- Sarah Foster, Agent

The Members agreed that the site visit had been very worthwhile. It was felt that the main issue was the landscape impact across the Warslow Moor area where there were extensive views and this is an isolated building so there would be significant impact on the landscape. This impact on the landscape combined with the extent the building needs to be rebuilt, almost becoming a new build, underpins Officer recommendation. It was acknowledged that not all derelict barns can be saved.

The motion to refuse the application with the addition of the application almost being a new build to the reason for refusal was proposed, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be REFUSED for the following reasons:

1. The hard surfacing of the access track, creation of a car parking area, domestic paraphernalia and lighting associated with the proposed use of the barn as a holiday let would cause significant harm to the landscape character of the area, contrary to Core Strategy policies GSP1, GSP2,

GSP3, L1, L3 and RT2, Development Management Plan policies DMC3 and DMC10 and the National Planning Policy Framework. The public benefits arising from the development would not outweigh the harm that has been identified.

- 2. Insufficient information has been submitted with the application to demonstrate that the development could be carried out without significant re-building of the barn.**

13:00pm A motion to continue the meeting past 1pm was moved, seconded, voted on and carried.

13.01pm The meeting adjourned for a short break and returned at 13.10pm.

61/24 S73 APPLICATION - FOR THE VARIATION OF CONDITION 3 FROM NP/DDD/0618/0562 TO OPEN ON MONDAY AT IVY COTTAGE, DALE HEAD, LYDGATE, EYAM (NP/DDD/0224/0160. EF)

Some Members had visited the site the previous day.

The Planning Officer presented the reported and outlined the reasons for approval.

The following spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme:

- Pat Gosling, Objector
- Kathleen Hall, Applicant

It was noted that there is no public footpath in front of the property however it maybe a ROW. Members felt that there were no particular issues associated with the Sunday opening and no reason not to approve the opening on Mondays. It was noted in the report that there was a 4th condition attached to approval however this had been included in error and therefore was removed from the list of conditions.

The motion to approve the application with the revised conditions was proposed, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

- 1. The development hereby permitted shall not be carried out otherwise than in complete accordance with the submitted details as amended by the following amended plans: Floor Plan of the Outbuilding dated 26.07.2018, Amended Floorplan of the External Seating Area dated 25.09.2018 and subject to the following conditions and/or modifications;**
- 2. The opening hours shall be between 11:00 and 17:00 on Sundays and Mondays only.**
- 3. The use of the premises hereby permitted shall be for a tea room ancillary to the residential use of Ivy Cottage.**

62/24 FULL APPLICATION - CHANGE LOW LEVEL BOLLARD LIGHTING TO REAR CAR PARK ENTRANCE FROM BACK LANE AT MOORLAND HOUSE STATION ROAD, HATHERSAGE (NP/DDD/0124/0112, EF)

The Planning Officer presented the report and outlined the reasons for approval.

Members were happy that the concerns of the residents and the Parish Council had been resolved.

The motion to approve the application was proposed, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following planning conditions:

- 1. Statutory 3-year time limit.**
- 2. In accordance with specified approved plans and specifications and subject to the following conditions or modifications**

63/24 HOUSEHOLDER APPLICATION - PROPOSED ERECTION OF A SINGLE GARAGE AND STORE AT 15 EYAM WOODLANDS, GRINDLEFORD (NP/DDD/0224/0208, WE)

Members had a drive-by this site the previous day.

The Planning Officer presented the report and outlined the reasons for refusal.

The following spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme:

- Jane Newman, Agent

Members welcomed the design of the green roof. It was also noted that rain-water would also be harvested. However they were concerned about the safety of the roof and would recommend having some form of safety fencing. Members asked what conditions would be imposed if they were minded to approve this and the Officer clarified these conditions.

13:45pm Cllr Hanley left the meeting.

A motion to approve the application contrary to Officer recommendation was moved, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

- 1. Commence development within 3 years.**
- 2. Carry out in accordance with specified approved plans.**

3. **Materials to be natural stone walling to match house**
4. **Recess garage door 150mm**
5. **Maintain garage and outside parking spaces for designated use.**
6. **Landscaping including details of green roof**
7. **Withdraw permitted development rights for fencing, walling or other means of enclosure on the development**
8. **No flood or other external lighting except in accordance with scheme to be agreed in writing.**

64/24 PLANNING PERFORMANCE UPDATE (BJT)

The Head of Planning presented his report and updated the committee on current performance of the Authority's development management function.

It was noted that the current figures are showing that the Authority is now performing above the national standard for speed of determination over the 2 year designation period and that the two year average is now around 75%. As such the Authority has now moved out of the risk of designation. Officers remain engaged with the Planning Advisory Service to look for further service improvement with a key element looking to have good engagement at the start of the process. The recent resumption of the pre-application advice service will help with that.

Congratulations and thanks were extended to all involved for their hard work in getting the service back on track.

A suggestion to address the public perception of the number of applications that are approved on a monthly basis was put forward. It was noted that there is a monthly delegated items list which members should receive. A pro-active communications strategy is being looked at and developed by the CEO.

The recommendation was moved, seconded, put to the vote and carried.

RESOLVED:

To note the report.

65/24 AUTHORITY SOLICITOR REPORT - PLANNING APPEALS (A.1536/AE)

The Committee considered the monthly report on planning appeals lodged, withdrawn and decided.

RESOLVED:

To note the report.

The meeting ended at 2.00 pm